

## **Unequal Unemployment:**

### **Unemployment Disparities in Pennsylvania**

#### BY MARK PRICE<sup>1</sup>

The Pennsylvania economy has shed 182,000 jobs since the start of the recession leading to the worst labor market workers in Pennsylvania have seen since the early 1980s. The state unemployment rate in the second quarter was 8.1%, up from 4.5% at the start of the recession in the fourth quarter of 2007. The overall unemployment rate obscures growing disparities in unemployment for people living in rural portions of the Commonwealth and for African-Americans.

#### **Unemployment Rates in Rural and Urban Pennsylvania**

In the early 1980s, measured by unemployment rates, rural Pennsylvania experienced a substantially more economic recession than urban Pennsylvania.<sup>2</sup> The rural unemployment rate peaked at nearly 17% compared to about 12% in urban areas. Since the late 1980s, however, the rural unemployment has gradually fallen toward the urban rate in Pennsylvania. Before the recession started, rural unemployment rates fell to only a little above the urban—4.9% in the first quarter of 2007 versus 4.4% for urban Pennsylvania (Table 1). But by the second quarter of 2009 the largest increases as well as the highest rates of unemployment were in rural counties (Table 6, page 3). As a result the gap between rural and urban unemployment rates has once again started to widen, with rural unemployment rates reaching 8.9% compared to 7.9% in urban Pennsylvania.

## **Unemployment Rates by Race**<sup>3</sup>

Estimates based on seasonally adjusted Local Area

Unemployment Statistics (LAUS) and the Current Population Survey (CPS) show that the unemployment rate for African Americans in Pennsylvania stood at 12.9% in the second quarter of 2009, an increase of six

Table 1. The Unemployment Rate Has Increased More In Rural Pennsylvania Than in Urban Pennsylvania

| Rural and urban unemployment rates |             |             |            |  |  |
|------------------------------------|-------------|-------------|------------|--|--|
| Region                             | 4th Quarter | 2nd Quarter | Difference |  |  |
|                                    | 2007        | 2009        |            |  |  |
| Rural                              | 4.9%        | 8.9%        | 3.9%       |  |  |
| Urban                              | 4.4%        | 7.9%        | 3.3%       |  |  |

Urban and Rural Counties are defined here according to the definition of rural provided by the Center for Rural Pennsylvania. See a color coded map of Rural and Urban PA at the following address

http://www.ruralpa.org/ruralcounties.html.

Source. Keystone Research Center (KRC) estimates using Center for Workforce Information and Analysis (CWIA) Local Area Unemployment Statistics (LAUS).

# Table 2. For African Americans in Pennsylvania the Increase in Unemployment so far in this Recession is as Great as During the 1981 Recession

The Change in Unemployment Rates Six Quarters After the Start of the Recession

| Current Recession                                                               |                     |                     |            |  |  |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|------------|--|--|
| Race                                                                            | 4th Quarter<br>2007 | 2nd Quarter<br>2009 | Difference |  |  |
| White                                                                           | 4.0%                | 7.2%                | 3.2%       |  |  |
| African-American                                                                | 6.9%                | 12.9%               | 6.0%       |  |  |
| 1981 Recession                                                                  |                     |                     |            |  |  |
| Race                                                                            | 3rd Quarter<br>1983 | 1st Quarter<br>1983 | Difference |  |  |
| White                                                                           | 8.3%                | 12.6%               | 4.4%       |  |  |
| African-American                                                                | 10.1%               | 15.6%               | 5.5%       |  |  |
| Source. KRC estimates using CWIA LAUS and Current Population Survey (CPS) data. |                     |                     |            |  |  |

percentage points from the start of the recession (Table 2, previous page).<sup>4</sup> As a result, the gap between the unemployment rate of white and African-American workers has doubled since the start of the recession. For African Americans, unemployment has increased more in this recession than during the severe 1981 recession when overall unemployment rates peaked in Pennsylvania at 12.9 percent.

#### **Unemployment Rates by Gender**

More than half of the Pennsylvania jobs lost since the start of this recession have been in manufacturing and construction, two predominately male sectors.<sup>5</sup> Unemployment rates among men in Pennsylvania are estimated to have climbed from 5.1% in the fourth quarter of 2007 to 9.2% in the second quarter of 2009 (Table 3). Unemployment rates among women in Pennsylvania over the same period increased from 3.9% to 7%.

| Table 3. Unemployment Rates Among Men Have Increased |
|------------------------------------------------------|
| Somewhat More Than for Women Since the Start of the  |
| Recession.                                           |

| Gender                                              | 4th Quarter<br>2007 | 2nd Quarter<br>2009 | Difference |  |  |  |
|-----------------------------------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|------------|--|--|--|
| Male                                                | 5.1%                | 9.2%                | 4.1%       |  |  |  |
| Female 3.9% 7.0% 3                                  |                     |                     |            |  |  |  |
| Source. KRC estimates using CWIA LAUS and CPS data. |                     |                     |            |  |  |  |

#### **Unemployment Rates by Educational Attainment**

The least-educated workers generally have higher unemployment rates because, as a group, they greatly outnumber the job openings they are qualified to fill. In recessions, the number of job seekers per job opening rises for all workers regardless of educational attainment.<sup>6</sup> recession is no different with unemployment rates rising substantially for all workers at all levels of educational attainment. Workers with less than a high school education now face an unemployment rate of 14.3%, nearly double the unemployment rate for this group at the start of the recession (Table 4). Unemployment rates for workers with a Bachelors degree or higher have more than doubled from 1.6% at the start of the recession to 3.4% in the second quarter of 2009.

#### **Unemployment Rates by Age**

Younger workers change jobs more frequently than older workers and have fewer financial commitments -- both factors which, all else held constant, lead to higher unemployment rates. As of the second quarter of this year, the

# Table 4. Unemployment Rates Are Up for All Workers in Pennsylvania Regardless of Their Educational Attainment

Unemployment rates by educational attainment for workers age 25 and older

| Educational Attainment                              | 4th Quarter | 2nd Quarter | I Ditterence |  |
|-----------------------------------------------------|-------------|-------------|--------------|--|
| Educational Attainment                              | 2007        | 2009        |              |  |
| Less Than High School                               | 7.4%        | 14.3%       | 6.8%         |  |
| High School                                         | 4.3%        | 8.0%        | 3.7%         |  |
| Some College                                        | 2.8%        | 7.3%        | 4.5%         |  |
| Bachelors degree or greater                         | 1.6%        | 3.4%        | 1.8%         |  |
| Source. KRC estimates using CWIA LAUS and CPS data. |             |             |              |  |

## Table 5. The Unemployment Rate for People Age 20 to 29 Was 12.1% in the 2nd Quarter of This Year

| Unemployment rates by age |             |             |            |  |
|---------------------------|-------------|-------------|------------|--|
| Ago                       | 4th Quarter | 2nd Quarter | Difference |  |
| Age                       | 2007        | 2009        | Difference |  |
| 20 to 29                  | 7.6%        | 12.1%       | 4.4%       |  |
| 30 to 49                  | 3.3%        | 6.6%        | 3.4%       |  |
| 50 and Older              | 2.7%        | 6.0%        | 3.3%       |  |

Note. Limitations imposed by sample size prevent estimation of unemployment rates for workers age 16 to 19.

Source. KRC estimates using CWIA LAUS and CPS data

unemployment rate for workers age 20 to 29 was 12.1%, an increase of 4.4 percentage points from the start of the recession (Table 5). Older workers have not been immune from this recession with unemployment rates doubling for workers age 30 to 49 and for those over 50.

| Table 6. Unemp          | lovment Rate        | es by County        | in Pennsylva    | nia              |                                                                          |                                         |
|-------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|-----------------|------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------|
| Tuble 6. Offering       | noyment nat         | es by county        | IIII CIIIISYIVE |                  | Ran                                                                      | k by                                    |
| County                  | 4th Quarter<br>2007 | 2nd Quarter<br>2009 | Difference      | rural /<br>urban | Increase in Unemployment<br>Rate Since 4th Quarter<br>2007 (1 = highest) | 2nd Quarter 2009 Level (1<br>= highest) |
| Cameron                 | 5.8%                | 17.8%               | 12.0%           | rural            | 1                                                                        | 1                                       |
| Elk                     | 4.7%                | 14.4%               |                 | rural            | 2                                                                        | 2                                       |
| Fulton                  | 6.1%                | 13.7%               | 7.6%            |                  | 3                                                                        | 3                                       |
| Mercer<br>Potter        | 5.6%<br>6.8%        | 11.6%<br>11.4%      | 4.6%            | rural            | 17                                                                       | 5                                       |
| Bedford                 | 5.4%                | 11.2%               |                 | rural            | 5                                                                        |                                         |
| Huntingdon              | 5.5%                | 11.2%               | 5.7%            |                  | 6                                                                        |                                         |
| McKean                  | 4.8%                | 10.6%               | 5.7%            |                  | 7                                                                        | 8                                       |
| Clearfield              | 5.7%<br>5.5%        | 10.5%               | 4.8%<br>4.8%    |                  | 13                                                                       | 9                                       |
| Carbon<br>Forest        | 6.4%                | 10.3%<br>10.3%      | 3.9%            |                  | 33                                                                       | 11                                      |
| Tioga                   | 5.6%                | 10.2%               |                 | rural            | 16                                                                       | 12                                      |
| Crawford                | 4.9%                | 10.1%               |                 | rural            | 8                                                                        | 13                                      |
| Schuylkill              | 5.1%                | 10.1%               |                 | rural            | 9                                                                        | 14                                      |
| Mifflin<br>Philadelphia | 5.6%<br>6.2%        | 10.1%<br>9.9%       | 4.4%            | rural<br>urban   | 38                                                                       | 15<br>16                                |
| Northumberland          | 5.1%                | 9.9%                |                 | rural            | 14                                                                       | 17                                      |
| Armstrong               | 5.1%                | 9.8%                | 4.7%            |                  | 15                                                                       | 18                                      |
| Jefferson               | 4.8%                | 9.7%                | 4.9%            | rural            | 10                                                                       | 19                                      |
| Lawrence                | 5.5%                | 9.6%                |                 | rural            | 25                                                                       | 20                                      |
| Clarion<br>Clinton      | 5.1%<br>5.4%        | 9.6%<br>9.4%        | 4.5%            | rural<br>rural   | 19                                                                       | 21                                      |
| Pike                    | 5.2%                | 9.4%                |                 | rural            | 24                                                                       | 23                                      |
| Fayette                 | 5.8%                | 9.2%                |                 | rural            | 46                                                                       | 24                                      |
| Luzerne                 | 5.2%                | 9.2%                |                 | urban            | 32                                                                       | 25                                      |
| Monroe                  | 5.0%                | 9.2%                |                 | rural            | 23                                                                       | 26                                      |
| Erie<br>Lycoming        | 5.0%<br>5.0%        | 9.1%<br>9.1%        |                 | urban<br>rural   | 26<br>27                                                                 | 27<br>28                                |
| Union                   | 5.2%                | 9.1%                |                 | rural            | 34                                                                       | 29                                      |
| Berks                   | 4.4%                | 9.0%                |                 | urban            | 18                                                                       | 30                                      |
| Wyoming                 | 5.5%                | 8.9%                | 3.4%            | rural            | 47                                                                       | 31                                      |
| Venango                 | 5.1%                | 8.9%                | 3.7%            |                  | 36                                                                       | 32                                      |
| Cambria<br>Columbia     | 5.5%<br>5.2%        | 8.8%<br>8.8%        |                 | rural<br>rural   | 51<br>42                                                                 | 33                                      |
| Sullivan                | 4.5%                | 8.7%                | 4.2%            |                  | 22                                                                       | 35                                      |
| Lehigh                  | 4.6%                | 8.7%                |                 | urban            | 28                                                                       | 36                                      |
| Somers et               | 5.5%                | 8.7%                |                 | rural            | 53                                                                       | 37                                      |
| Snyder                  | 5.0%<br>4.8%        | 8.7%<br>8.6%        |                 | rural<br>rural   | 39<br>35                                                                 | 38                                      |
| Bradford<br>Juniata     | 4.8%                | 8.5%                | 4.0%            |                  | 31                                                                       | 40                                      |
| Northampton             | 4.6%                | 8.3%                |                 | urban            | 37                                                                       | 41                                      |
| Beaver                  | 4.8%                | 8.3%                | 3.6%            | urban            | 41                                                                       | 42                                      |
| York                    | 3.9%                | 8.3%                | 4.4%            | urban            | 21                                                                       | 43                                      |
| Franklin<br>Lackawanna  | 3.4%<br>4.9%        | 8.3%<br>8.3%        |                 | rural<br>urban   | 11 49                                                                    |                                         |
| Westmoreland            | 4.7%                | 8.0%                |                 | urban            | 50                                                                       |                                         |
| Warren                  | 4.7%                | 8.0%                |                 | rural            | 52                                                                       |                                         |
| Washington              | 4.7%                | 7.9%                |                 | rural            | 56                                                                       |                                         |
| Susquehanna             | 4.4%                | 7.9%                |                 | rural            | 45                                                                       |                                         |
| Greene<br>Perry         | 5.2%<br>4.2%        | 7.8%<br>7.7%        |                 | rural<br>rural   | 65                                                                       |                                         |
| Adams                   | 3.5%                | 7.6%                |                 | rural            | 29                                                                       |                                         |
| Dauphin                 | 4.0%                | 7.5%                | 3.5%            | urban            | 43                                                                       | 53                                      |
| Blair                   | 4.3%                | 7.4%                |                 | rural            | 60                                                                       |                                         |
| Indiana                 | 4.8%                |                     |                 | rural            | 64                                                                       |                                         |
| Bucks<br>Delaware       | 4.0%<br>4.2%        | 7.4%<br>7.4%        |                 | urban<br>urban   | 48 59                                                                    |                                         |
| Butler                  | 4.1%                | 7.4%                |                 | rural            | 54                                                                       |                                         |
| Wayne                   | 4.3%                | 7.3%                |                 | rural            | 62                                                                       | 59                                      |
| Lancaster               | 3.5%                | 7.2%                |                 | urban            | 40                                                                       |                                         |
| Montgomery<br>Lebanon   | 3.6%<br>3.5%        | 6.8%<br>6.8%        |                 | urban<br>urban   | 57<br>55                                                                 | 61<br>62                                |
| Montour                 | 4.0%                |                     |                 | rural            | 63                                                                       |                                         |
| Allegheny               | 4.3%                | 6.8%                |                 | urban            | 66                                                                       |                                         |
| Cumberland              | 3.5%                | 6.6%                | 3.2%            | urban            | 58                                                                       | 65                                      |
| Chester                 | 3.2%                | 6.3%                |                 | urban            | 61                                                                       | 66                                      |
| Centre                  | 3.6%                | 5.7%                |                 | rural            | 67 of rural provided by the Center                                       | 67                                      |
| Orban and Ruidi (       | countries are a     | ciiiicu iici e dCl  | corumg to tile  | aciiiii li Uil U | n rurar provided by the Cente                                            | Li ioi Nui ai Felllisylvalild.          |

Urban and Rural Counties are defined here according to the definition of rural provided by the Center for Rural Pennsylvania. See a color coded map of Rural and Urban PA at the following address http://www.ruralpa.org/ruralcounties.html.

Source. KRC estimates using CWIA LAUS.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Mark Price is a Labor Economist at the Keystone Research Center he holds a PhD in economics from the University of Utah

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> For a profile of the status of rural workers in the Pennsylvania labor market see *The State of Rural Pennsylvania*, available online <a href="http://keystoneresearch.org/ruralpa/pdf/srpa508.pdf">http://keystoneresearch.org/ruralpa/pdf/srpa508.pdf</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The methods used in this report are based on Algernon Austin *Unequal Unemployment: Racial disparities in unemployment vary widely by state*, Issue Brief #257, Economic Policy Institute, July 15, 2009. Additional assistance was provided by Kai Filion also of the Economic Policy Institute.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> The Center for Workforce Information (CWIA) and Analysis in collaboration with the Bureau of Labor Statistics releases Local Area Unemployment Statistics (LAUS) for Pennsylvania each month based on data derived from the Current Population Survey (CPS), unemployment insurance claims, and employment data from the Current Employment Statistics (CES). These unemployment rates are not calculated by demographic group. To estimate unemployment rates by demographic group this report utilizes the most recent six months of CPS data to estimate the unemployment rate for each demographic group (race, gender, age group and educational attainment). A ratio of the unemployment rate for each demographic group to statewide unemployment rate, again calculated based on the most recent six months of data, is then calculated. This ratio is then multiplied by the seasonally adjusted statewide unemployment rate published by CWIA in order to derive an estimate of the seasonally adjusted unemployment rate for each demographic group.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> For a profile of the status of women in the Pennsylvania labor market see *The State of Women in the Pennsylvania Workforce 2008*, available online <a href="http://www.keystoneresearch.org/womensearnings/KRC\_womenswages.pdf">http://www.keystoneresearch.org/womensearnings/KRC\_womenswages.pdf</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> According to the Bureau of Labor Statistics' latest Job Openings and Labor Turnover Survey (JOLTS) there are 5.7 job seekers per available job opening in May in the United States. At the start of this recession in December 2007 there were 1.7 job seekers per available job opening.